

在「雞蟲」與「沉船」之間：華人性工業中的玩界男性化特質

江紹祺

香港大學社會學系

travis@hku.hk

新自由主義下的新道德主義國際會議

嶺南大學

2014年5月23至25日

初稿

請勿引述、複製或傳閱

摘要

本研究自2012年開始，以華人性工業中付錢買性的香港男性為對象（「男嫖客」），進行了二十四個深入訪談和兩個焦點小組討論，探討他們在性交易過程中所衍生的男性身份問題。

嫖客的男性化特質可以分為若干類型：「雞蟲」（或麥性事式的男性化特質）是指那些以與愈多女性進行性交易為榮的嫖客；「沉船」（或鐵達尼式的男性化特質）是指那些渴望與性工作者發展親密關係的嫖客。而在兩者之間，「玩界」男性化特質是指那些只在既定時間內尋找情感依戀的嫖客。從嫖客的角度而言，這種男性化特質強調保留「過盛」的性慾，以及劃分性愛和情感的需要，好處是能夠在享受消閒的性歡愉之時亦不會挑戰他們現有同伴式的婚姻或伴侶關係。它代表了在享受性交易所帶來的刺激之時，需要在規範化的「邊界」上與相關的風險進行協商。因此，買性可以被視為一種消閒式的邊界活動，當中牽涉秩序與混亂之間的邊界協商過程。

透過對香港男嫖客的性交易經驗進行社會學分析，本研究旨在探討親密關係的意義和本質，並且重新思索在後工業資本主義帶動的新都市性文化下，所牽涉的男性化特質與兩性之間性別秩序轉變的關係。

引言

調查指出在 2010 年，約有 300,000 至 400,000 香港男性曾經光顧女性性工作者¹。不過，我們對於這個為數不少的男性人口所知不多。本文嘗試對他們作出深入的探討：為什麼他們會付錢買性呢？他們怎樣在性交易的過程中與風險協商呢？他們的嫖妓經驗與其男性身份有何關係？他們想買的其實是什麼？性交易是否純粹一種性宣洩而必然是異化和非人性化的舉動呢？他們會買愛嗎？當中可有機會發生既牽涉錢銀交易又包含情愛關係的境況呢？買性這個行為與香港或整個後工業資本社會的宏觀社會過程又有何關係？

這些俗稱男嫖客的男性是在學術研究上經常被遺忘的一群，他們往往缺席於任何國際或本土有關娼妓和男性研究的文獻(例如 Weitzer 2009)。例如香港的娼妓研究大多被醫學和公共衛生領域所壟斷，強調以女性性工作者(例如 Chan, Ho and Lo 2002)、找尋女性性工作者的男嫖客(例如 Lau and Tsui 2003)和男性性工作者(例如 Lau et al. 2004)為監控和研究對象。現存雖然有少量關於女性性工作者(例如 Kong 2006; Laidler, Petersen, and Emerton 2007)和男性性工作者(例如 Kong 2009)的社會學研究，但均沒有男嫖客的相關討論。

始於 1990 年代末期，有關男性化特質的研究相繼出現，主要圍繞兩大範圍：一)與西方男性化特質(主要是白人)交織下遷移華人的男性化特質(例如 Espiritu 1997; Chen 1999; Kong 2002; Chow 2008)；二)中國傳統文化下的華人男性化特質(例如 Kong 2011; Song and Hird 2013)。不過，他們多以歷史檔案和中國古代典籍，或當代媒體文本的文學分析為主，詳見 Kong(2012a)有關華人男性化特質研究的回顧。此外，亦有少量牽涉男性化特質與性交易(例如 Zhang 2006; Peng 2007)或「二奶」現象(例如 Xiao 2011)的關係之社會學和人類學的研究。

因此，娼妓是社會學其中一個重要的研究範疇，但值得注意的是，男嫖客的聲音往往被忽略，又或者只集中於性工作者一方的論述，任何有關娼妓的爭辯只停留於單方面的說法。縱使有關男性和男性化特質的研究迅速發展，再加上華人男性化特質研究的陸續出現，但他們始終未能著眼於剖析男性付錢買性的經驗與男性化特質的關係。其實，男嫖客與性工作者的研究同等重要，由於娼妓的爭辯主要落在供應的層面上，前者的聲音可以對此作出平衡。此外，研究男嫖客亦與研究其他男性一樣，能夠挑戰現有男性化特質的研究。他們的聲音非常重要，讓我們了解男性性態這個與男性身份有著密切關係的重要基石。本研究豐富了現存稀少

¹ 研究指出在 1998 和 2001 年期間，有 10.8—14% 年齡介乎 18 至 60 歲的男性表示曾經光顧女性性工作者(Lau and Tsui 2003)。若果我們假設相同的百分比，但將其延伸至其他研究所顯示的年齡群組(Hong Kong Advisory Council on AIDS 2006)，並以 2010 年人口結構作推算的話，粗略估計在年齡介乎 15 至 74 歲的男性人口之中(數目為 2,686,300，總體人口的 80.9%)，約有 290,000 至 376,000 男性曾經光顧女性性工作者。

的文獻，並且將香港有關娼妓和男性化特質的研究緊扣在一起。

在 2012 至 2013 年，本人與 40 位男嫖客進行深入訪談(包括 24 位異性戀者和 16 位男同性戀者)和四個焦點小組討論。本文建基於其中二十四個深入訪談和兩個焦點小組討論，對象均自稱是光顧女性性工作者的異性戀者。訪談的長度由 1.5 小時至 3 小時不等。他們的年齡介乎 17 至 68 歲，平均為 35.8 歲。當中 9 位是單身，另外 9 位有固定女朋友，5 位已婚，以及 1 位曾經離婚。教育程度方面，只有一位是小學畢業，其餘是中學(8 位)或大專程度或以上(15 位)。他們首次光顧女性性工作者的年齡介乎 15 至 35 歲，平均為 22.6 歲。他們光顧女性性工作者的年資由 6 個月至 35 年不等，平均為 11.5 年。他們光顧女性性工作者不外乎以下幾個原因：趁自己年輕和單身時嘗試與人發生性行為、不滿已有的婚姻或伴侶關係，以及是一種社交活動(例如與別人慶祝生日和酒後活動)，即華人商業文化中的一部分，包括宴請、到卡拉 ok 酒廊和酒吧消遣等。

在英治時期(1842 至 1997 年)，香港政府跟隨英國用來規管娼妓的「廢娼」制度，以求平衡公眾秩序和個人自由(West 2000)，即只有俗稱「一樓一」(意指一位性工作者在獨立單位內進行性交易)才算「合法」，任何唆使引誘他人作不道德行為，以及牽涉第三者的活動(例如依靠他人賣淫收入為生和經營賣淫場所等)均被禁止。香港現存的娼妓形式包括街頭賣淫、一樓一鳳、在酒廊、推拿場所和馬檻進行的性交易，以及新興的「援助交際」²。自中國大陸在 1978 年進行改革開放以來，香港和南中國(例如東莞和深圳)之間的跨境性工業也發展迅速，變得普遍起來(Lang and Smart 2002; So 2003)。

中國政府則實施「禁娼」制度，凡牽涉第三者的娼妓活動均屬刑事罪行，一經定罪，會被判監禁和罰款。此外，雖然只涉及妓女和嫖客之間的性交易未被刑事化，但卻被視為危害社會，需要接受一段時期的勞改(一般為期 15 天)和繳交罰款。在中國大陸，娼妓活動出現的場所包括低級髮廊、按摩中心、卡拉 ok 酒廊和高級夜總會。

華人男性化特質與異性戀中心下的男性化劇本

那麼，男性身份與性交易有何關係呢？在華人男性化特質和以異性戀為中心的男性化劇本之背景下，我們可以怎樣理解這些男嫖客呢？在傳統中國，男性身份與社會道德有著密切的關係。當時的社會道德著重男性是否能夠遵從權力的架構，

² 自從 2000 年代，出現了新興的援助交際(enjo-kosai)。這個詞語源於日本，意指老年男性透過向女性(主要是女學生，亦有些是家庭主婦)提供金錢或禮物，而與她們建立同伴關係，甚至提出性要求。由於她們往往是未成年，並且透過「網上傾談」而開展相關活動，故現已受到眾多媒體的關注。

男性必需符合不同的社會期望，例如在結婚和生兒育女之外，容許保留自己「過盛」的性慾(例如自瀆、嫖妓和同性戀等) (Louie 2003: 6-7)。因此，只要他們能夠履行作為丈夫和照顧家庭的責任，並且有能力可以控制其慾念的話，男性嫖妓並非必然與男性化特質有所抵觸。在傳統父權社會的男性化特質下，尤其是那些富家子弟和奉行一夫多妻的男性，生育和同伴關係內的性(例如與妻子和妾侍發生性行為)與消遣的性(例如與僕人、傭人、名妓和妓女發生性行為)兩者可以是並行不悖的。

儒家倫理強調男性應當孝順父母、貢獻家庭和履行道德責任，致使在香港這個現代工業社會出現所謂功利家庭主義(Lau 1982: 72)。男性作為一家之主，傳統父權社會的男性化特質過渡成為掙錢養家的男性化特質，不再強調儒家思想崇高的道德修為和自我完善，反而著重物質保障和財富擁有(特別在工作的領域上)，以及是否可以成功建立家庭和維持家庭生活所需。再者，香港社會其實一直普遍奉行一夫多妻和父母安排的婚姻(根據風俗慣例的婚姻形式)，直至 1971 年以後，建基於自由選擇和兩性平等的一夫一妻制(民事婚姻或基督宗教的婚姻形式)才成為唯一得到法律認可的婚姻模式。這種「同伴式」的現代性態模式(或者是「擁有對方的論述」,Hollway 1984: 232)，已經主導了西方社會超過一個世紀的時間。由於香港曾受英國殖民統治，在強烈的基督宗教思想影響下，使這些長久的、異性戀的和一對一的戀愛模式備受推崇，並且成為量度其他戀愛關係的標準(Kong 2011: 111)。根據 Rubin(1993)有關性階層的闡述，這種霸權式的同伴性態關係成為「良好性態圈」內的核心，高舉異性戀的、婚姻的、一對一的、生育的和牽涉任何金錢的戀愛模式，但卻會導致處於外圍地帶的性態，例如性濫交、非生育的性、隨意的性或性交易等的性關係受到污名化。在性階層的分級下，這些消遣的性(Laumann et al 1994: 171)，例如一夜情、婚外情或嫖妓等便會被負面標籤。雖然主流社會較為傾向懲罰情婦和妓女等「他者」，但男嫖客也會被視為「不良」、「病態」和「罪大惡極」而遭到歧視。

在後工業資本主義下，兩性之間的性別秩序和都市性文化均有所轉變。在香港這個後工業社會，功利家庭主義讓路予物質個人主義，意指著重個人能力和利益財富的追求，並以此作為定義一個成功人士的重要指標(Kong 2009: 726-7)。不過，由於經濟轉型(以製造業主導的社會逐漸被知識型經濟所取代)、女性教育程度提高和女性就業人口增長的關係(Leung and Chan 2012)，香港男性對於呈現掙錢養家這個男性化特質感到無比壓力。在親密關係方面，「同伴式的婚姻模式」仍屬社會的規範(Lam, Lam and Leung 2005: 252)，男性(尤其是年輕一代)更加傾向迎合浪漫化的劇本，即追求一種理想的戀愛路徑，當中包括經歷求愛、約會、墜入愛河、一生一世的承諾和建立排他的、一對一的和非金錢交易的親密伴侶或婚姻關係。不過，這亦會構成一種張力，特別與植根於傳統中國父權文化裡默許享樂式的和消遣式的性倫理，以及消費都市性文化裡認可「濫交式」的性歡愉

(Laumann et al 1994: 351)有所違背。因此，他們的男性身份消弭於這兩個近乎相互抵觸的男性性態論述，導致他們渴望在不同的親密和性關係上找尋情感和性需要。在這個背景下，我們可以了解香港的男嫖客如何利用相關的策略去處理他們與女性性工作者之間的關係，繼而滿足其自身的性和情感需要。

嫖客的男性化特質

那麼，他們在性交易的過程中其實是想買些什麼呢？這又與他們的男性身份有何關係？Allan，32歲，中學畢業，是一名汽車機械技工。他於18歲時在旺角的馬檻初嘗性經驗，對方是經朋友介紹下的一名女性性工作者。自此，他便沉醉於此，曾經試過在同一天之內多次與性工作者發生性關係。跟其他人一樣，他以「男性天生性慾旺盛的論述」(Hollway 1984:231)為理由來合理化自己的行為，講述自己經常希望與人性交，「我好想扑嘢，成日都好想扑嘢」。他從不介意與誰人發生性行為，並且認為在自己年輕時這種貪得無厭的慾望較難得到滿足。他經常光顧馬檻的女性，找尋一種所謂「泰勒式的性愛」，即是有組織的、具固定時限的、含標準服務的、機械式的和非人性化的性愛(Bernstein 2007: 171)。

他與其他幾位受訪者一樣，以付錢與愈多女性發生泰勒式的性愛為榮。這種麥當勞化的性愛(Hausbeck and Brents 2002)，提供了快捷、便宜和簡易的服務，女性被視為具效率的、可預計的和可計算的身體給予嫖客消費。根據受訪者所記述，以及香港電影《一路向西》(由胡耀輝執導，2012年作品)的生動描寫，最能夠代表這個情況的例子便是位於東莞的大型性工業，當中有數百位女性以圖像陳列的方式示人，以供男人選擇和購買。這種麥性事式的男性化特質，或者俗稱是「雞蟲」的本地用語，鞏固了兩性之間的不平等狀況和將性別歧視合理化，並且提升了他們的自我，「我覺得自己好似係皇帝咁囉」。

雖然與別人發生性行為是他們首要關注的地方，但是大部份受訪者均不欲表面上追求泰勒式的性愛，反而希望可以與具有情感和肉體依賴的女性發生性關係。他們大多渴望「擁抱和接吻」，並且以「擁有對方的論述」(Hollway 1984: 232)來解釋他們的投入。Aron，25歲，大學程度，單身，沒有女朋友。雖然他與Allan一樣，首次性經驗都是透過與女性性工作者發生性關係而得到，但不同的是，他並不只是追求單純的肉體關係，反而是希望可以與她們建立情感交流，「我好鍾意大家有傾有講……我鍾意攞攞錫錫同埋傾計，之後先慢慢咁做，咁我就會好high嫁喇」。

換言之，大部份受訪者跟Aron一樣，其實不太喜歡泰勒式的性愛，即是一種標準化的、機械式的和非人性化的性關係。他們所購買的不只是性勞工而是「性事

上的情感勞工」(Kong 2006)，亦即是本人提出的「玩界」男性化特質，所追求的是局限在既定時間內與這些女性建立半浪漫的情感連繫(Plumridge et al 1997)，又或者是 Bernstein (2007)所提出的「玩界真實性」。他們清楚知道整套遊戲規則，並且樂於投入這場限定的性交易。他們追尋「性是消遣」中短暫的「性是浪漫」之體驗，意味著從消遣的性購買這種局限在既定時間內的所謂「浪漫」。

他們傾向與性工作者建立清晰的界線，以維持「性是浪漫」和「性是消遣」兩者之間的分野。不過，日子久了，部份嫖客可能會與女性性工作者產生特別的感情。阿德，52 歲，已婚，中學程度，是一名商人，他是一位很有經驗的男嫖客，嫖妓超過三十年。他是具有這種「玩界」男性化特質的典型例子，以與這些女性劃清界線為榮。不過，他曾經在中國大陸光顧同一名女性性工作者達兩年之久，甚至到訪她的家鄉和給錢幫助她的家人起屋，這都普遍被視為男嫖客送給內地性工作者的「禮物」。對於阿德而言，由於牽涉太多非商業的親密關係，這種半浪漫的關係是頗為危險的。這解釋為何不少嫖客，尤其是已婚男性，認為婚外情較諸於娼妓更加破壞婚姻關係。

阿德慶幸自己從來不是一艘「沉船」(在網上嫖客討論區內廣泛使用的本地用語)，意指愛上性工作者的嫖客，並且被視為頭號禁忌。不過，亦有其中一組受訪男性聲言希望自己是一艘「沉船」，更稱自己為鐵達尼號的一員(一艘大型「沉船」)。

羅先生現在 40 歲，已婚，育有一女，大學程度，是一名資訊科技從業員。他跟其他鐵達尼號的成員一樣，與女性性工作者建立了一種猶如傳統的非商業親密關係，亦即體現了傳統異性戀男性的性劇本(Sanders 2008a)，例如經常與她們傾電話和發電郵以進行「正常」的溝通、跟隨求愛的禮儀(包括逛街、共晉晚餐和看電影等)、享受如與女朋友或妻子般的性舒展和親暱舉動，以及重視情感，友愛和連繫多於性交。因此，他們所追求的是一種典型的女朋友經驗((Bernstein 2007: 125; Sanders 2008b: 93-94)。

如果麥性事式的男性化特質代表著滿足男性天生性慾和實質地消費女性身體的話，那麼，在浪漫化的劇本下，「玩界」男性化特質和鐵達尼式的男性化特質便是強調性交易關係中情感的一面，以彌補他們在其非商業親密關係中未必得到的情感需要。當「玩界」男性化特質為戀愛(性是浪漫)和歡愉(性是消遣)訂下清晰界線之時，鐵達尼式的男性化特質則將此界線模糊起來；當麥性事式的男性化特質以與一定數量的女性發生性關係為榮之時，「玩界」男性化特質和鐵達尼式的男性化特質所關心的是與這些女性相處的質量。麥性事式的男性化特質偏好泰勒式的性愛，「玩界」男性化特質鍾情「既定時間內的浪漫」，而鐵達尼式的男性化特質則沉醉於女朋友經驗之中。

根據受訪者的引述，「玩界」男性化特質是最為理想的狀態。這種特質既肯定了男性的情感和性需要，亦同時在不挑戰其同伴式的婚姻或伴侶關係的大前提下，讓他們在同伴關係的性和消遣的性之間找到平衡。在「雞蟲」與「沉船」，以及「衝動的性」與「浪漫的愛」之間，香港的男嫖客傾向選擇這種華人男性化特質，即強調控制與平衡(例如維持戀愛與性歡愉的界線)、可計算性和時間管理(例如商業和非商業關係的時間分配)。

買性作為消閒的邊界活動

由於強調控制與平衡，這種買性的行為被視為一種消閒的邊界活動。Lyng (1990; 2005)以跳傘活動為例子，將進行邊界活動概念化為一種可以駕馭高風險、高刺激性和強大感官活動的能力。這些自願投身其中的個體既可以對其生活或處境有所控制，亦能夠將自己盡量推向肉體或精神的界限，即徘徊在生命與死亡之間、有意識與無意識之間、正常與瘋狂之間，以及秩序與混亂之間。由於要將自己推向邊界，他們往往需要一些特定的技巧、能力和資源，當中最重要的是講求如何控制(秩序)相關的處境才可以避免落入混亂之中。雖然他們在過程中可能會出現恐懼和危險，但是這些(成功)經驗卻會帶來一種「自我實現」、刺激和興奮的感覺，以及有時難以形容的所謂超現實性(「較日常存在的生活更為真實」)。

將這個邊界活動的概念放在買性上，香港的男性(特別是具有「玩界」男性化特質的個體)需要在秩序與混亂之間協商不同形式的風險。首先，嫖妓可以是令人「成癮的」，尤其是在消費式的都市性文化下眾多女性的身體被陳列和出售。值得注意的是，與伴侶發生性關係雖然被視為較安全和正常，但卻是枯燥和沉悶的；而之於性工作雖然較為危險和冒險，但會帶來刺激和興奮的感覺。前者傾向講求承諾與責任，後者則注重消費和快感(即是「我」的時間)。因此，第一層的邊界活動是指管制其過盛的性慾，並且需要在正常與「成癮」消費的邊界中進行協商。在一段時間過後，買性的男性很可能會對某些性工作者產生特別的感覺，甚至與他們建立情感和戀愛的關係，但這並不代表他們意圖犧牲自己已有的婚姻或伴侶關係，他們會將同伴的性和消遣的性分開。第二層的邊界活動就是要維持同伴的性和消遣的性這兩者的界線，避免將後者變成前者，否則只會令享樂化為承諾而失去了刺激的感覺。在大部份的社會裡，基於同伴式的性態這個霸權模式，娼妓仍是不被社會大眾接受的行為，男性經常需要向家人和社交圈子隱瞞自己曾經光顧性工作者。第三層的邊界活動是代表將自己藏匿於衣櫃之中，以求不被揭發，這對於已婚或有固定伴侶的男性來說更加是重要的一環。再者，嫖妓既是越軌亦是違法的行為，所以最後一層的邊界活動是如何避免遭到逮捕的風險。換言之，這些男性在享受消遣的性所帶來的刺激之時，亦需要在同伴的性這個規範化的「邊界」上與相關的風險進行協商，包括過渡沉溺的風險、將消遣的性變

成同伴的性的風險、被揭發的風險，以及被捕的風險。因此，他們需要在正常與「成癮」消費之間、在享樂與承諾之間、在好男人與壞男人之間，以及在合法與違法行為之間進行協商。

男人買性說明了邊界活動在當代世界的矛盾性和複雜性。一方面，性交易被視為逃離與抵抗同伴式的性態這個霸權模式，亦即受訪者經常強調同伴關係的性是非常枯燥乏味的。他們對於教條式的浪漫化論述，例如長久、穩定和安逸等感到疲倦。換言之，他們抗拒「枯燥、理性和可計算的世界，希望在逃避的過程中尋找快樂.....在混亂的邊界上」(O' Malley and Mugford 1994: 194)。再者，是為邊界活動的性交易置身於這個「非文明空間」的性場所裡(例如馬檻、按摩中心和時鐘酒店等)，男嫖客可以抵抗「這些情感限制、理性計算、常規化和文明等現代社會的權威教條」(Lyng 2005: 6)。性交易，就如其他邊界活動一樣，成為男性逃離社會期望的工具，並且讓他們得到個人成長和性格發展的機會。買性的男人希望在家生活和生活科層制度以外尋找一個短暫的避難所。透過性交易，他們可以經歷強烈的自我認同感，並且可以控制和行使被主流社會所剝奪的性權利。

另一方面，這些從性交易中學習得來的技巧和能力，實為晚現代社會的重要文化原則和組織需要。例如，他們控制「過盛」的性交易與其他人控制如娛樂性用藥(Reith 2005)和暴飲暴食或厭食(Gailey 2009)般的行為相類似。這些尋找同伴的性和消遣的性之間的平衡，以及不會摧毀兩者界線的男性，亦與人們控制和平衡不同領域的生活如出一轍，例如明確分開個人承諾(家庭和婚姻生活)和工作責任，以及個人理想和發展(例如嗜好及興趣)。他們的雙重生活，亦與人們保守自己的秘密和維持公共形象與私人自我的界線並無異致。他們逃避警方的拘捕亦與人們理性化自己的越軌行為一樣，利用一些「求生空間」來與法例周旋。換言之，他們在買性過程中所呈現出來的技巧，即對於過盛的管理、控制與平衡、具警覺性和自我調節，以及相信其求生空間等，訂下了「在制度化的風險社會裡這些風險承擔的習性和所需的技巧」(Lyng 2005: 10)。邊界活動不只是塑造現代親密關係中男性的性劇本，亦是都市社會生活重要的組成部份。

討論與總結

付錢買性的香港男性可被視為集「性愛、物質和情感利益」(Rofel 2007: 3)於一身的慾望個體。他們對戀愛、性和親密關係有著一連串的渴望、需要和嚮往，情況就如 Giddens (1991)所闡述的「自我的反思計劃」般，投入於自我的建構。不過，他們認為將自身的需要和慾望只放在與同一伴侶所建立的「同伴式」關係是過分理想化和不太現實的，甚至限制了自我的發展。因此，情感和性關係兩者是可以分割開來的。商業的性被視為一種較為理想的選擇，使婚姻與其他非商業的

親密關係得以並存。除了非商業的伴侶外，亦可以與性工作者建立一定程度的親密關係。再者，就如其他貨品一樣，親密關係都可以是被購買和消費的。

透過對香港男性嫖妓經驗進行社會學分析，本研究對理解後工業資本主義和新都市性文化下的男性化特質提出了新的觀點。首先，它呈現了塑造不同文化形式上的男性化特質之結構性轉變。這種由傳統父權主義式的男性化特質過渡至現代掙錢養家的男性化特質，繼而是出現後工業平等主義式的男性化特質之轉變，可能與女性運動的興起並無直接的關係，反而是由於父權力量為了回應制度上的轉變而作出的更替，例如由過往以製造業為主的社會發展成現今知識型經濟的轉型、女性就業人口的增長，以及戀愛與親密關係的轉變。

第二，它呈現了後工業社會的娼妓事業並非只是提供和消費不同的性慾身體，或者被正常化為一般的消閒活動，例如做運動和吃喝玩樂等，而是將情感融入於商業的性契約之中，模糊了私人和公眾領域的界線。第三，它同時指出男嫖客並非屬於一個同質性的群體，透過他們在嫖妓之中獲得不同的情感和性需要，所包含的是一連串的經驗和身份(例如麥性事式的男性化特質、「玩界」男性化特質和鐵達尼式的男性化特質)。這三種男性化特質在分析上雖然有其明顯的分野，但現實上，一個男性可以在不同的時間內將它們呈現出來，又或者在同一時間內與不同女性呈現不一樣的特質。

第四，由於是強調控制和平衡，「玩界」男性化特質被視為最理想的狀態(至少在本研究的樣本上)。男人買性可以被理解為一種消閒的邊界活動，所牽涉的是在秩序與混亂之間的邊界協商過程。他們在享受消遣的性所帶來的刺激之時，亦需要在規範化的「邊界」上與相關的風險進行協商。此外，買性的男人被視為對抗同伴式的性態這個規範模式，而他們行使的技巧亦是晚現代社會所需的重要文化原則。

最後，它反映了男性在面對性與親密關係之中相互抵觸的需求，致使他們消弭於平等主義式的同伴關係和濫交式的性歡愉之間、同伴式的性和消遣式的性之間、承諾和娛樂之間，以及戀愛與歡愉之間。這個兩難的狀態並不只是出現在華人的男性身上，亦是全球化世界下其他社會的男性所共同面對的。

鳴謝

本研究得到 Hong Kong Research Grant Council Public Policy Research Funding Scheme ‘Purchasing Sex, Consuming Love: A Qualitative Study of Hong Kong Men Who Buy Sex’ (HKU 7014-PPR-12)的資助。

參考書目

- Bernstein, E. (2007) *Temporarily Yours: Intimacy, Authenticity and the Commerce of Sex*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Chan, M. K. T., Ho, K. M., and Lo, K.K. (2002) ‘Behaviour sentinel surveillance for female sex workers in the social hygiene service in Hong Kong’ (1999-2000)’ *International Journal of STD and AIDS* 13 (12): 815-820.
- Chen, A. S. (1999) ‘Lives at the center of the periphery, lives at the periphery of the center: Chinese American masculinities and bargaining with hegemony’ *Gender & Society* 13 (5): 584-607.
- Chow, Y.F. (2008) ‘Martial arts films and Dutch-Chinese masculinities: smaller is better’, *China Information*, XXII (2): 331-359.
- Espiritu, Yen Le. (1997) *Asian American Women and Men: Labor, Laws, and Love*, Thousand Oaks: Sage.
- Gailey, J.A. (2009) “‘Starving is the most fun a girl can have’: the pro-ana subculture as edgework”, *Critical Criminology* 17 (2): 93-108.
- Giddens, A. (1991) *Modernity and Self-Identity: Self and Society in the Late Modern Age*, Cambridge: Polity.
- Giddens, A. (1992) *The Transformation of Intimacy: Sexuality, Love and Eroticism in Modern Societies*, Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Hausbeck, K., and Brents, B. (2002) ‘McDonaldization of the sex industries? The business of sex’ in G. Ritzer (ed.) *McDonaldization: The Reader*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Pine Forrester Press, pp. 91-106.
- Hawkes, G. (2004) *Sex and Pleasure in Western Culture*, Cambridge: Polity.
- Hollway, W. (1984) ‘Gender difference and the production of subjectivity’ in Henriques, J., Hallway, W., Urwin, C., Venn, C., and Walkerdine, V. *Changing the Subject: Psychology, Social regulation and Subjectivity*. London: Methuen & Co. Ltd, pp. 227-263.
- Hong Kong Advisory Council on AIDS (2006) *Report of Community Assessment and Evaluation of HIV Prevention for Commercial Sex Workers and their Clients in Hong Kong 2006*, Hong Kong: Department of Health, HKSAR.
- Illouz, E. (1997) *Consuming the Romantic Utopia: Love and the Cultural Contradictions of Capitalism*, Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Jamieson, L. (2004) ‘Intimacy, negotiated nonmonogamy, and the limits of the couple’, in J. Duncombe, K. Harrison, G. Allan, and D. Marsden (eds) *The State of Affairs: Explorations in Infidelity and Commitment*, London: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc., pp. 35-57.
- Kong, T.S.K. (2006) ‘What it feels like for a whore: the body politics of women performing erotic labour in Hong Kong’, *Gender, Work and Organization* 13 (5): 409-434.
- Kong, T.S.K. (2009) ‘More than a sex machine: accomplishing masculinity among Chinese male sex workers in the Hong Kong sex industry’, *Deviant Behavior* 30: 715-745.

- Kong, T.S.K. (2011) *Chinese Male Homosexualities: Memba, Tongzhi and Golden Boy*, London: Routledge.
- Kong, T.S.K. (2012a) 'Chinese Male Bodies: A Transnational Study of Masculinity and Sexuality', in B. Turner (ed.) *The Routledge International Handbook of Body Studies*, London: Routledge, pp. 289-306.
- Laidler, K.J., Petersen, C., and Emerton, R. (2007) 'Bureaucratic justice: the incarceration of mainland Chinese women working in Hong Kong' sex industry', *International Journal of Offender Therapy and Comparative Criminology* 51 (1): 68-83.
- Lam, C.W., Lam, W.M. and Leung, T.Y.K. (2005) 'The changing nature and ideology of marriage in Hong Kong', in K.P.H. Young and A.Y.L. Fok (eds) *Marriage, Divorce and Remarriage: Professional Practice in the Hong Kong Cultural Context*, Hong Kong: HKU Press, pp. 243-66.
- Lang, G., and J. Smart (2002) 'Migration and the 'second wife' in South China: toward cross-border polygyny' *International Migration Review* 36 (2): 546-569.
- Lau, J.T.F. and Tsui, H.Y. (2003) 'Behavioral surveillance surveys of the male clients of female sex workers in Hong Kong: results of three population-based surveys', *Sexually Transmitted Diseases* 30 (8): 620-628.
- Lau, J.T.F., Kim, J.H., Lau, M., and Tsui, H.Y. (2004) 'HIV related behaviours and attitudes among Chinese men who have sex with men in Hong Kong: a population based study', *Sexually Transmitted Infections* 80: 459-465.
- Lau, S.K. (1982) *Society and Politics in Hong Kong*, Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press.
- Laumann, E.O., Gagnon, J.H., Michael, R.T., and Michaels, S. (1994) *The Social Organization of Sexuality: Sexual Practices in the United States*, Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.
- Lethbridge, H. (1978) *Hong Kong: Stability and Change: A Collection of Essays*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Leung, L. C. and Chan, K.W. (2012) 'Understanding the masculinity crisis: implications for men's services in Hong Kong', *British Journal of Social Work*: 1-20. [published online 10 Aug 2012]
- Louie, K. (2002) *Theorising Chinese Masculinity: Society and Gender in China*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Louie, K. (2003) 'Chinese, Japanese and global masculine identities', in K. Louie and M. Low (eds) *Asian Masculinities: The Meaning and Practice of Manhood in China and Japan*, London and New York: RoutledgeCurzon, pp. 1-15.
- Lyng, S. (1990) 'Edgework: a social psychological analysis of voluntary risk taking', *The American Journal of Sociology* 95 (4): 851-886
- Lyng, S. (2005) (ed.) *Edgework: The Sociology of Risk-taking*. London: Routledge.
- O'Malley, P. and S. Mugford (1994) 'Crime, excitement, and modernity', in G. Barak (ed.) *Varieties of Criminology: Readings from a dynamic discipline*, pp.189-211. Westport, Connecticut: Praeger.
- Pang, L. K. and Wong, D. (eds.) (2005) *Masculinities and Hong Kong Cinema*, Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press.
- Peng, Y.W. (2007) 'Domination and difference in the discourse of Taiwanese *piao-ke*' *Men and Masculinities* 9(3): 315-336.
- Plumridge, E.W., S.J. Chetwynd, A. Reed and S. J. Gifford (1997) 'Discourse of emotionality in commercial sex: the missing client voice' *Feminism & Psychology* 7 (2): 165-181.
- Reith, G. (2005) 'On the edge: drugs and consumption of risk in late modernity', in S.

- Lyng (ed.) *Edgework: The Sociology of Risk-taking*, pp. 227-245. London: Routledge.
- Rofel, L. (2007) *Desiring China: Experiments in Neoliberalism, Sexuality, and Public Culture*, Durham and London: Duke University Press.
- Rubin, G.S. (1993) 'Thinking sex: notes for a radical theory of the politics of sexuality', in C. Vance (ed.) *Pleasure and Danger: Exploring Female Sexuality*, Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- Sanders, T. (2005) *Sex Work: A Risky Business*, Devon: Willan.
- Sanders, T. (2008a) 'Male sexual scripts: intimacy, sexuality and pleasure in the purchase of commercial sex' *Sociology* 42(3): 400-417.
- Sanders, T. (2008b) *Paying for Pleasure: Men Who Buy Sex*, Devon: Willan.
- So, A.Y. (2003) 'Cross-border families in Hong Kong: the role of social class and politics', *Critical Asian Studies* 35 (4): 515-534.
- Song, G. (2004) *The Fragile Scholar: Power and Masculinity in Chinese Culture*, Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press.
- Song, G. and Hird, D. (2013) *Men and Masculinities in Contemporary China*, Leiden: Brill Publishers
- Song, G. and Lee, T. K. (2010) 'Consumption, class formation and sexuality: reading men's lifestyle magazines in China', *The China Journal*, 64: 159-177.
- Van Gulik, R.H. (1961) *Sexual Life in Ancient China: A Preliminary Survey of Chinese Sex and Society from ca. 1500 B.C. till 1644 A.D.*, Leiden, Netherlands: E.J. Brill.
- Weitzer, R. (2009) 'Sociology of Sex Work'. *Annual Review of Sociology* 35: 213-34.
- West, J. (2000) 'Prostitution: collectives and the politics of regulation', *Gender, Work & Organization* 7(2):106-118.
- Xiao, S.W. (2011) 'The "second wife" phenomenon and the relational construction of class-coded masculinities in contemporary China', *Men and Masculinities* 14 (5): 607-627.
- Zhang, T.T. (2006) 'Cool masculinity: male clients' sex consumption and business alliance in urban China's sex industry' *Journal of Contemporary China* 46: 161-182.

**BETWEEN 'CHICKEN WORM' AND 'SUNKEN BOAT': BOUNDED
MASCULINITY IN THE CHINESE SEX INDUSTRY**

Travis S.K. KONG
Department of Sociology
The University of Hong Kong
travisk@hku.hk

**NEO-MORALISM UNDER NEO-LIBERALISM
INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE AT LINGNAN UNIVERSITY
23-25 May 2014**

DRAFT

PLEASE DO NOT CITE, REPRODUCE, OR CIRCULATE

ABSTRACT

Drawn from 24 in-depth interviews and 2 focus group discussions conducted since 2012 with Hong Kong men who buy sex ('male clients') in the Chinese sex industry, this paper discusses men's involvement with commercial sex in relation to their male identity.

A few types of client masculinity have been identified: 'Chicken worm' (or McSex masculinity) refers to those men who are proud of paying for rather impersonal sex with as many women as they wish whilst 'sunken boat' (or Titanic masculinity) refers to those men who passionately seek intense emotional intimacy with sex workers. Between these two opposing types, 'bounded' masculinity refers to those men who seek emotionally responsive women in a time-bounded romance. It is this type, which emphasizes the containment of 'excess' sexuality and the compartmentalization of sexual and emotional needs, that is privileged in the clients' perspective as it allows the satisfaction of recreational sexuality without challenging the companionate model of marriage/coupled relationship. It is also this type of client masculinity that negotiates risks at the normative 'edge' of social behavior while enjoying the thrill of commercial sex. Buying sex could thus be seen as a form of leisure edgework which involves the fundamental boundary of negotiation between order and chaos.

Through a sociological analysis of men's commercial sexual experiences in Hong Kong, this research examines the meaning and nature of intimacy and rethinks masculinity in relation to the changing gender order between the sexes under the new urban sexual culture of post-industrial capitalism.

INTRODUCTION

Studies show that approximately 300,000-400,000 men visited female sex workers in Hong Kong in 2010¹. However, little is known about this considerably sizeable male population. This paper will take a closer look at these men: Why do they buy sex? How do they negotiate the risks involved in sex work? How does such an experience relate to their male identity? What exactly do they buy? Is commercial sex simply a quick sexual release which is always alienated and impersonal? Do they buy love? Is a commercial but intimate relationship possible? How does the act of buying sex relate to broader social processes in Hong Kong or post-industrial capitalist society?

These men, known as male clients, are an often neglected research subject, which is largely absent from both prostitution and men's studies in international and local literatures (e.g., Weitzer 2009). For example, in Hong Kong, studies of prostitution are overwhelmingly dominated by the medical and public health model with an emphasis on surveillance and baseline research on female sex workers (e.g., Chan, Ho and Lo 2002), male clients who find female sex workers (e.g., Lau and Tsui 2003) or male sex workers (e.g., Lau et al. 2004). There are a few sociological studies of female sex workers (e.g., Kong 2006; Laidler, Petersen, and Emerton 2007) and male sex workers (e.g., Kong 2009) but none have yet been done on male clients.

Studies of Chinese masculinity have slowly emerged in the late 1990s and focus mainly on two areas: (1) diasporic Chinese masculinity under western (mainly white) masculinity (e.g., Espiritu 1997; Chen 1999; Kong 2002; Chow 2008); and (2) Chinese masculinities in Chinese dominated cultures (e.g., Kong 2011; Song and Hird 2013), but research leans more towards literary analysis of historical records and Chinese classics (e.g., Louie 2002; Wu 2004; Song 2004) or contemporary media texts (e.g., Pang and Wong 2005; Song and Lee 2010). For a review of the studies of Chinese masculinity, see Kong (2012a). A small body of sociological and anthropological studies have emerged that focus on masculinity in relation to commercial sex (e.g., Zhang 2006; Peng 2007) or the 'second wife' phenomenon (e.g., Xiao 2011).

Prostitution, then, is a distinctive research area in sociology, yet the voice of male clients is either under-represented or only appears in workers' narratives. Any debate about prostitution is therefore mainly informed by one side. Although studies of men and masculinity are burgeoning and the study of Chinese masculinity has slowly emerged, very few focus on the experience of men who buy sex in relation to masculinity. Male clients are as legitimate a topic as sex workers and their voices are important to balance the prostitute debate which has been mainly informed by the supply side. Likewise, male clients are as valid a topic as other men whose masculinity is put into question in masculinity studies. Their voices are important for us to understand men's sexuality, which is a cornerstone of male identity. This

¹ Studies show that 10.8-14% of men aged 18-60 reported visiting female sex workers during the period of 1998 to 2001 (Lau and Tsui 2003). If we assume the same percentage of male clients but expand to more age groups as reported in other studies (Hong Kong Advisory Council on AIDS 2006) and project to the 2010 population structure, the crude estimates of the male population aged 15-74 (n=2,686,300; 80.9% of the whole population) who visited female sex workers ranged from 290,000 to 376,000 in 2010.

research thus adds onto the existing scarce literature and builds a bridge to studies of prostitution and masculinity in Hong Kong.

In 2012-2013, I conducted in-depth interviews with 40 male clients (24 straights and 16 gays) and four focus group discussions. This article is based on 24 in-depth interviews and 2 focus groups conducted with self-identified straight men who patronised female sex workers. The interviews ranged in length from one-and-a-half to three hours. Their ages ranged from 17-68 with a mean age of 35.8. Nine were single, another nine were single with regular girlfriend(s), five married, and one divorced. While one had only primary education, the rest were either secondary educated (n=8) or tertiary educated or above (n=15). Their ages of first patronizing female sex workers ranged from 15 to 35 with the mean of 22.6. Their lengths of involvement with patronizing female sex workers ranged from 6 months to 35 years, with the mean of 11.5 years. There are a few main reasons why they patronized female sex workers: wanted to try out sex when they were young and single; dissatisfied with current coupled/partnered relationships; as a social activity (e.g., someone's birthday, after-drink activity), and part of a Chinese business culture in which dining, visiting karaoke lounges and hostess bar is part of the package.

Due to its colonial history (1842-1997), the Hong Kong government has followed the British 'abolition' model of regulating prostitution which balances public disorder and private freedom (West 2000). Prostitution has been decriminalized and is legal only when an individual works independently and indoors. Soliciting and all third party activities (e.g., pimping, 'keeping a vice establishment') are prohibited. The current common forms of prostitution in Hong Kong are street prostitution, one-woman brothels, karaoke bars, massage parlours, escorts, and the newly emerged 'compensated dating'². Cross-border commercial sex between Hong Kong and Southern China (e.g., Dongguan and Shenzhen) has become very common since China began its reforms in 1978 (Lang and Smart 2002; So 2003).

The Chinese government has implemented a 'prohibition' model of prostitution. According to this model, third party prostitution is a criminal offence, punishable by a number of years of imprisonment, with possible fines. First party prostitution is not criminalized but is regarded as socially harmful, with both prostitutes and their clients being subject to periods of reform detention (usually for 15 days), along with possible fines. Common prostitution settings in China include low end hair salons, massage parlours, karaoke clubs, and high end night clubs.

CHINESE MASCULINITIES AND HETEROSEXUAL MASCULINE SCRIPTS

What is the relationship between male identity and commercial sex? How do we understand the male client in the context of Chinese masculinities and heterosexual masculine scripts? In traditional China, male identity was closely associated with social morality. The social morality of male sexuality primarily concerned correct

² Since 2000s, a newly-emerged form is compensated dating. The term compensated dating (enjo-kosai) originates from Japan, referring to older men giving money and/or luxury gifts to women (primarily school girls and also housewives) for their companionship and possibly sexual favour. This has now caught much media attention as the girls are often underage, and initiated through 'on-line conversations'.

conformity to hierarchies of power, within which men had to fulfil social expectations, such as getting married and siring children; and secondarily with the containment of 'excessive' sexuality (e.g., as manifested in masturbation, prostitution, homosexuality, etc.) (Louie 2003: 6-7). In this sense, men's patronage with prostitutes did not necessarily imply a violation of masculinity providing he fulfilled conjugal and family duties and had the ability to control his desire. Traditional patriarchal masculinity, especially for those who were rich and under polygamy, permitted the co-existence of procreative and companionate sexualities (e.g., wives and concubines) with recreational sexualities (e.g., maids, servants, courtesans, and prostitutes).

Confucian ethos that stressed filial piety, family commitment and moral responsibility in a man has given way to utilitarianistic familism in modern industrial Hong Kong (Lau 1982: 72). Traditional patriarchal masculinity, as the head of the household, has shifted to breadwinner masculinity, which focuses less on Confucian ideals of moral cultivation and self-perfection, but on material security and possession (especially in the realm of work) and the success of building a family in order to improve family livelihood and wealth. Moreover, polygamy and arranged marriage (in the form of customary marriage) were widely practiced in Hong Kong until 1971, the year when monogamous marriage in the form of civil marriage or Christian marriage, which is based on freedom of choice and equal status between sexes, became the only legal form of marriage. This modern 'companionate' model of sexuality (or 'the have/hold discourse' Hollway 1984: 232) has been dominant in the West for over a century. Due to Hong Kong's colonial history with its strong Christian influences, the life-long, heterosexual and monogamous notion of love is privileged, and serves as a yardstick with which to measure any form of love (Kong 2011: 111). This hegemonic companionate sexuality is the core of the 'charmed circle' of sexuality in Rubin's (1993) notion of sex hierarchy: heterosexual, marital, monogamous, reproductive or non-commercial. The result of this ideal is the stigmatization of sexuality in the 'outer limits' (Rubin 1993) such as being promiscuous, non-procreative, casual or commercial. It is under this hierarchical valuation of sex that recreational sexuality (Laumann et al 1994: 171) such as a one night stand, extra-marital affairs, or prostitution, is stigmatized. Although society tends to punish more the 'other women' like mistresses and prostitutes, male clients are also discriminated as they are 'bad', 'sick' or 'sinful'.

The gender order between the sexes as well as urban sexual culture has changed in post-industrial capitalism. In post-industrial Hong Kong, utilitarianistic familism has given way to materialistic individualism in which individual competence and material success have both become key dimensions for defining a man (Kong 2009: 726-7). However, Hong Kong men have felt the pressure of performing breadwinner masculinity due to economic restructuring from a manufacturing-based to a knowledge-based economy, the rise of women's education and their participation in the labour market (Leung and Chan 2012). In the realm of intimacy, the 'companionate marriage model' is still the norm (Lam, Lam and Leung 2005: 252) and men (especially the younger generations) are increasingly prone to the romantic script that prescribes an ideal trajectory of a relationship through courting, dating, falling in love, and then forming a lifelong commitment with sexually exclusive (monogamous) marriage or non-commercial intimate partnered relationship. However, this creates tension as they are also subject to the hedonistic and recreational sexual ethics rooted in the traditional Chinese patriarchal culture as well as under the

'promiscuous paradigm' of sexual pleasure that has been largely endorsed in the consumerist urban sexual culture (Laumann et al 1994: 351). That is, they are torn between two rather opposing discourses of heterosexual male sexuality in the formation of male identity. The result is to seek ways to fulfil emotional and sexual needs in different intimate and sexual relationships. It is against this background that we can understand how Hong Kong male clients employ strategies to handle female sex workers in order to fulfil their sexual and emotional needs.

CLIENT MASCULINITIES

What exactly do they buy during commercial sex? And how does this relate to their male identity? Allan is 32 years old and a car mechanic with secondary education. His first sexual experience happened when he was 18 years old with a female sex worker whom was introduced to by his friend in a brothel in Mongkok. Since then, he has been addicted to it and even had sex with sex workers a few times a day. For him, as others, he has made use of the 'natural male sex drive discourse' (Hollway 1984: 231) to justify his behaviour. As he said, 'I wanted to fuck, always wanted to fuck'. He did not care whom he had sex with and claimed to have an insatiable desire that could hardly have been satisfied when he was young. He frequented brothel women a lot and was looking for a kind of Taylorised sex, i.e., organized within a fixed time boundary with a standard package and more mechanical and impersonal (Bernstein 2007: 171).

He, as with a few others, is proud of paying for Taylorised sex with as many women as he wishes. This McDonaldization of sex (Hausbeck and Brents 2002) provides fast, cheap and easy service and offers efficient, predictable, and calculable women's bodies to consume. This is best exemplified by the mega sex industry in Dongguan in which hundreds of women are in graphic display, ready for men to choose and consume, as reported by the respondents and also captured vividly in the movie *Due West: Our Sex Journey* (dir. Mark Wu 2012). This McSex masculinity, or in local parlance, 'chicken worm', usually boosts their ego ('I feel like a king') by reinforcing the inequality between sexes and justifying gender discrimination.

Although having sex was their primary concern, most of the respondents apparently did not seek Taylorised sex but an emotionally and physically responsive woman to have sex with. Many reported that they wanted 'hugging and kissing', making use of the 'have/hold discourse' (Hollway 1984: 232) to explain their involvement. Aron is 25 years old, university educated, and single without a girlfriend. Like Allan, he had his first sexual experience with a female sex worker. Unlike Allan, he never looks for pure physical sex, but emotional interactions with female sex workers, 'I like the emotional interaction... I like the way we kiss, we hug, and we talk, things like that, do it slowly and then I will get very high.'

In other words, most of them, like Aron, dislike Taylorised sex – standardized, mechanical, impersonal kind of sex. What they purchase is thus not just a sexual labour but an 'emotional labour of sex' (Kong 2006). They are what I call 'bounded' masculinity in which they seek a time-bounded quasi-romantic and emotional connection with these women (Plumridge et al 1997) or what Bernstein (2007) calls 'bounded authenticity'. They know the exact rules of this clear and bounded

commercial transaction and they quite enjoy it. They look for the temporal 'sex-as-romance' within the domain of 'sex-as-recreation'. Time-bounded 'romance' is thus purchased as a form of recreational sex.

They tend to establish a clear boundary with these sex workers and uphold the distinction between 'sex-as-romance' and 'sex-as-recreation'. However, over time, some clients may encounter female sex workers whom they have special feelings. Ah Tak is 52 years old, married, secondary educated, a businessman and a very experienced male client with more than 30 years of engagement in prostitution. He embodies typical 'bounded' masculinity and is proud of making a clear boundary with these women. However, he did patronize a female sex worker in China for two years and even visited her home village and paid her to build a house for her family, a very common 'gift' of clients to sex workers in China. This quasi-romantic relationship, for Ah Tak, was more dangerous, as it resembled too much a non-commercial intimate relationship. This is why most clients, especially those who are married, argue that extra-marital affairs, not prostitution, are much more damaging to marriage.

Ah Tak was proud that he was no longer a 'sunken boat', the local parlance referring to clients who fall in love with sex workers, which is seen as the number one taboo popularly circulated in online client forums. However, I have come across a subgroup of men who deliberately want to be a 'sunken boat' and some of them even call themselves a member of Titanic (a big 'sunken boat').

Mr. Law is now 40, married with a daughter, university educated, and works in the IT industry. He, as with other Titanic members, has relationships with female sex workers that mirror very much a conventional non-commercial intimate relationship, embodied in the conventional heterosexual male sexual script (Sanders 2008a). For example, they maintain 'ordinary' communication with these girls such as talking to each other over phone, writing emails, etc.; they follow courtship rituals like shopping, dining, watching movies; they engage with 'comfortable' sex like girlfriends or wives with sensual acts; and they value emotion, friendship and connection over sexual intercourse. They are seeking what typically call a girlfriend experience (Bernstein 2007: 125; Sanders 2008b: 93-94).

If McSex masculinity represents a form of masculinity that emphasizes the fulfilment of natural male sexual desire and consumes women's bodies in a very real sense, both 'bounded' masculinity and Titanic masculinity emphasize the emotionality of commercial sexual relationship under the romantic script and fulfil their affective needs that may not be easily found in their non-commercial intimate relationships. While 'bounded' masculinity has set a clear boundary between love (sex-as-romance) and fun (sex-as-recreation), Titanic masculinity collapses such a boundary. While McSex masculinity is proud of the quantity of women one has sex with, both 'bounded' masculinity and Titanic masculinity concern the quality of the relationship with these women. McSex masculinity prefers Taylorised sex, 'bounded' masculinity favours 'time-bounded romance', and Titanic masculinity indulges in a girlfriend experience.

As reported by the respondents, 'bounded' masculinity is the privileged form of client masculinity. This 'bounded' masculinity acknowledges the emotional and sexual needs of men and tries to balance companionate sexuality and recreational sexuality

without challenging the companionate model of marriage/coupled relationship. Between 'chicken worm' and 'sunken boat', between the sex manic and the romantic, Hong Kong male clients tend to choose a type of Chinese masculinity that emphasize control and balance (e.g., upholds the boundary of love and fun) as well as calculability and time management (e.g., compartmentalization of time spent with commercial and non-commercial relationships).

BUYING SEX AS LEISURE EDGEWORK

It is this emphasis of control and balance in buying sex that the act can be seen as a leisure edgework. Using skydiving as a prime example, Lyng (1990, 2005) conceptualises edgework as the ability to monitor high-risk, thrilling and intensely sensational activities. Individuals who engage in these voluntary participatory activities maintain their sense of control over their lives and/or situations whilst pushing themselves to their physical and/or mental limits – the lines between life and death, consciousness and unconsciousness, sanity and insanity, and order and chaos. To push themselves to the edge, they need certain kind of skills, competence and resources and the most important is the ability to maintain control (order) of a situation in order not to diverge into chaos. Although they may encounter fear or threat in anticipating the experience, the (successful) experience produces a sense of 'self-actualization', thrill and excitement, and a kind of hyperreality ('much more real than everyday existence'), sometimes ineffable to describe.

Applying edgework to men buying sex, Hong Kong men (especially the one who embodies 'bounded masculinity') negotiate various risks between order and chaos. First of all, commercial sex could be quite 'addictive' especially under the consumerist urban sexual culture with so many women, on display and on sale. It is even so as sex with partners is usually regarded as safe and normal but also mundane and boring, whilst sex with sex workers is dangerous and risky but also exciting and fun. The former is more about commitment and duty but the latter is more about personal consumption and gratification (the 'me' time). So the first edgework is to regulate excess and to negotiate the boundary between normal and 'addicted' consumption. Over time, men who buy sex might develop special feelings for certain sex workers. They might develop a more emotional and loving relationship with them. But they have no intention to sacrifice their primary relationships over these relationships. They do have a clear separation between companionate and recreational sexuality. The second edgework is thus to maintain the boundary of companionate and recreational sexuality and not to turn recreational sexuality to companionate sexuality, which for them is to turn fun into commitment and then kill the thrill. Prostitution, in most societies, is still regarded as a socially unacceptable behaviour, which is derived from the hegemonic model of companionate sexuality. Men usually hide their involvement with the sex industry from their family and social circles. The third edgework is to stay in the closet and not to be discovered. This becomes an urgent task especially for those who are married or in a committed relationship. Moreover, prostitution in most societies is not just deviant but also illegal behaviour. So the final dimension of edgework is to find ways to escape from the risk of being caught.

In other words, these men negotiate risks at the normative 'edge' of the companionate sexuality while enjoying the thrill of recreational sex: the risk of overindulgence, the

risk of turning recreational sexuality to companionate sexuality, the risk of being discovered, and the risk of being caught. They thus negotiate the boundary between normal and 'addicted' consumption, between fun and commitment, between being a good man and a bad guy, and between legal and illegal behaviour.

Men buying sex indeed exemplifies the paradox of edgework in contemporary society. On the one hand, commercial sex could be seen as an escape from and resistance to the hegemonic model of companionate sexuality. Respondents frequently mentioned the mundane nature of companionate sexuality. They were tired of the pragmatic romantic narratives of longevity, stability and comfort. In other words, they refused the 'mundane, rational, calculative world and seek to escape through joy...at the edge of chaos.' (O'Malley and Mugford 1994: 194) Commercial sex, as an edgework practice, is located in the 'uncivilised space' of sex venues (e.g., brothels, massage parlour, love motels, etc.) where male clients resist the 'imperatives of emotional control, rational calculation, routinization, and reason in modern society.' (Lyng 2005: 6) Commercial sex, like other edgework, serves as a vehicle of escape from social expectations for a man (e.g., good worker, boyfriend, husband) and offers a few opportunities for personal transformation and character development. Men who buy sex seek a temporary escape from the conditions of family life and bureaucratic institutions. Through commercial sex, they experience an intense sensation of self-determination and control and exercise their sexual rights which to them seem to be deprived of by society.

On the other hand, the skills and competence learnt from commercial sex are indeed essential key cultural principles and key institutional demands of late-modern society. For example, the way these men regulate 'excess' commercial sex is the same way people regulate other 'excess' consumption practices (e.g., recreational drugs, Reith 2005), eating disorder (e.g., anorexic, Gailey 2009), or other leisure activities. The way these men balance companionate sexuality and recreational sexuality without collapsing the boundary is the same way people control and balance various aspects of their fragmented lives with clear compartmentalization on personal (family and conjugal) commitments and work duties and on personal pursuit and development (e.g., hobbies, interests). The way these men live a double life is the same way people keep their own secrets and maintain a clear division between public image and private self. The way these men escape from being caught by the police is the same way people rationalize their deviant behaviour and use a 'survival capacity' to get around the law. In other words, the skills embodied in buying sex – regulating excess, control and balance, being vigilant and self-reliant, and believing in one's survival capacity – valorise 'risk-taking propensities and skills in demand throughout the institutional structure of the risk society' (Lyng 2005: 10). Edgework not only plays a key role in shaping men's sexual scripts in modern intimacy but also seems to be an integral part of urban social life.

DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

Hong Kong men who buy sex could be seen as a desiring subject with 'sexual, material, and affective self-interest' (Rofel 2007: 3). They have a wide range of aspirations, needs and longings for love, sex and intimacy. They are increasingly preoccupied with the construction of the self, similar to what Giddens (1991) calls the

'reflective project of the self'. However, they find 'companionate' sexuality which condenses all their needs, wants and desires into one person to be too idealistic and unrealistic, and also restrict the development of their own selves. As a result, emotional and sexual relations can be separated. Commercial sex can be seen as a more realistic choice coexisting with marriage or other non-commercial intimate relationships. Intimacy is not only desired with non-commercial intimate partners but also with sex workers. And intimacy, like other goods, can be purchased and consumed.

Through a sociological analysis of Hong Kong men's commercial sexual experiences, this study brings new insights to understanding masculinity in the new urban sexual culture in post-industrial capitalism. First of all, it shows the importance of changing structural conditions in shaping cultural forms of masculinity. The change from traditional patriarchal masculinity to modern breadwinner masculinity to post-industrial egalitarian masculinity may be less directly related to the rise of women's movements but rather to the shift of patriarchal power in response to institutional changes such as the restructuring from a manufacturing-based to a knowledge-based economy, the growth of women's employment, and the transformation of love and intimacy.

Second, it shows that post-industrial prostitution not just provides different sexualized bodies to consume, or is normalized as leisure pursuits like sports, food or other entertainments, but blurs the boundary between the private and public spheres by incorporating emotion into the commercial sexual contract. Third, it also points out that male clients do not belong to a homogenous population but embody a range of experiences and identities (e.g., McSex masculinity, 'bounded' masculinity and Titanic masculinity) responsive to their different sexual and emotional needs through their participation in prostitution. These three types are analytically distinct but in reality a man could embody the three types at different times or embody different types with different women at the same time.

Fourth, 'bounded' masculinity is privileged (at least in this sample) with great emphasis on control and balance. Men's engagement with buying sex can thus be understood as a form of leisure edgework which involves the fundamental boundary of negotiation between order and chaos. They negotiate various risks at the normative 'edge' of social behaviour while enjoying the thrill of commercial sex. Men buying sex can be seen as a resistance to the normative model of companionate sexuality and that the skills they exercise are also key cultural principles needed in late-modern society.

Finally, this study shows the competing demands men are facing in relation to intimacy and sexuality as they are torn between an egalitarian companionate model of relationship and a promiscuous model of sexual pleasure, between companionate and recreational sexuality, between commitment and entertainment, and between love and fun. These dilemmas are not just faced by Chinese men but also men in other societies in the globalized world.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

This research is funded by Hong Kong Research Grant Council Public Policy Research Funding Scheme 'Purchasing Sex, Consuming Love: A Qualitative Study of Hong Kong Men Who Buy Sex' (HKU 7014-PPR-12)

REFERENCES

- Bernstein, E. (2007) *Temporarily Yours: Intimacy, Authenticity and the Commerce of Sex*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Chan, M. K. T., Ho, K. M., and Lo, K.K. (2002) 'Behaviour sentinel surveillance for female sex workers in the social hygiene service in Hong Kong' (1999-2000)' *International Journal of STD and AIDS* 13 (12): 815-820.
- Chen, A. S. (1999) 'Lives at the center of the periphery, lives at the periphery of the center: Chinese American masculinities and bargaining with hegemony' *Gender & Society* 13 (5): 584-607.
- Chow, Y.F. (2008) 'Martial arts films and Dutch-Chinese masculinities: smaller is better', *China Information*, XXII (2): 331-359.
- Espiritu, Yen Le. (1997) *Asian American Women and Men: Labor, Laws, and Love*, Thousand Oaks: Sage.
- Gailey, J.A. (2009) "'Starving is the most fun a girl can have": the pro-ana subculture as edgework', *Critical Criminology* 17 (2): 93-108.
- Giddens, A. (1991) *Modernity and Self-Identity: Self and Society in the Late Modern Age*, Cambridge: Polity.
- Giddens, A. (1992) *The Transformation of Intimacy: Sexuality, Love and Eroticism in Modern Societies*, Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Hausbeck, K., and Brents, B. (2002) 'McDonaldization of the sex industries? The business of sex' in G. Ritzer (ed.) *McDonaldization: The Reader*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Pine Forrest Press, pp. 91-106.
- Hawkes, G. (2004) *Sex and Pleasure in Western Culture*, Cambridge: Polity.
- Hollway, W. (1984) 'Gender difference and the production of subjectivity' in Henriques, J., Hallway, W., Urwin, C., Venn, C., and Walkerdine, V. *Changing the Subject: Psychology, Social regulation and Subjectivity*. London: Methuen & Co. Ltd, pp. 227-263.
- Hong Kong Advisory Council on AIDS (2006) *Report of Community Assessment and Evaluation of HIV Prevention for Commercial Sex Workers and their Clients in Hong Kong 2006*, Hong Kong: Department of Health, HKSAR.
- Illouz, E. (1997) *Consuming the Romantic Utopia: Love and the Cultural Contradictions of Capitalism*, Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Jamieson, L. (2004) 'Intimacy, negotiated nonmonogamy, and the limits of the couple', in J. Duncombe, K. Harrison, G. Allan, and D. Marsden (eds) *The State of Affairs: Explorations in Infidelity and Commitment*, London: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc., pp. 35-57.
- Kong, T.S.K. (2006) 'What it feels like for a whore: the body politics of women performing erotic labour in Hong Kong', *Gender, Work and Organization* 13 (5): 409-434.
- Kong, T.S.K. (2009) 'More than a sex machine: accomplishing masculinity among Chinese male sex workers in the Hong Kong sex industry', *Deviant Behavior* 30: 715-745.
- Kong, T.S.K. (2011) *Chinese Male Homosexualities: Memba, Tongzhi and Golden*

- Boy, London: Routledge.
- Kong, T.S.K. (2012a) 'Chinese Male Bodies: A Transnational Study of Masculinity and Sexuality', in B. Turner (ed.) *The Routledge International Handbook of Body Studies*, London: Routledge, pp. 289-306.
- Laidler, K.J., Petersen, C., and Emerton, R. (2007) 'Bureaucratic justice: the incarceration of mainland Chinese women working in Hong Kong' sex industry', *International Journal of Offender Therapy and Comparative Criminology* 51 (1): 68-83.
- Lam, C.W., Lam, W.M. and Leung, T.Y.K. (2005) 'The changing nature and ideology of marriage in Hong Kong', in K.P.H. Young and A.Y.L. Fok (eds) *Marriage, Divorce and Remarriage: Professional Practice in the Hong Kong Cultural Context*, Hong Kong: HKU Press, pp. 243-66.
- Lang, G., and J. Smart (2002) 'Migration and the 'second wife' in South China: toward cross-border polygyny' *International Migration Review* 36 (2): 546-569.
- Lau, J.T.F. and Tsui, H.Y. (2003) 'Behavioral surveillance surveys of the male clients of female sex workers in Hong Kong: results of three population-based surveys', *Sexually Transmitted Diseases* 30 (8): 620-628.
- Lau, J.T.F., Kim, J.H., Lau, M., and Tsui, H.Y. (2004) 'HIV related behaviours and attitudes among Chinese men who have sex with men in Hong Kong: a population based study', *Sexually Transmitted Infections* 80: 459-465.
- Lau, S.K. (1982) *Society and Politics in Hong Kong*, Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press.
- Laumann, E.O., Gagnon, J.H., Michael, R.T., and Michaels, S. (1994) *The Social Organization of Sexuality: Sexual Practices in the United States*, Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.
- Lethbridge, H. (1978) *Hong Kong: Stability and Change: A Collection of Essays*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Leung, L. C. and Chan, K.W. (2012) 'Understanding the masculinity crisis: implications for men's services in Hong Kong', *British Journal of Social Work*: 1-20. [published online 10 Aug 2012]
- Louie, K. (2002) *Theorising Chinese Masculinity: Society and Gender in China*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Louie, K. (2003) 'Chinese, Japanese and global masculine identities', in K. Louie and M. Low (eds) *Asian Masculinities: The Meaning and Practice of Manhood in China and Japan*, London and New York: RoutledgeCurzon, pp. 1-15.
- Lyng, S. (1990) 'Edgework: a social psychological analysis of voluntary risk taking', *The American Journal of Sociology* 95 (4): 851-886
- Lyng, S. (2005) (ed.) *Edgework: The Sociology of Risk-taking*. London: Routledge.
- O'Malley, P. and S. Mugford (1994) 'Crime, excitement, and modernity', in G. Barak (ed.) *Varieties of Criminology: Readings from a dynamic discipline*, pp.189-211. Westport, Connecticut: Praeger.
- Pang, L. K. and Wong, D. (eds.) (2005) *Masculinities and Hong Kong Cinema*, Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press.
- Peng, Y.W. (2007) 'Domination and difference in the discourse of Taiwanese *piao-ke*' *Men and Masculinities* 9(3): 315-336.
- Plumridge, E.W., S.J. Chetwynd, A. Reed and S. J. Gifford (1997) 'Discourse of emotionality in commercial sex: the missing client voice' *Feminism & Psychology* 7 (2): 165-181.
- Reith, G. (2005) 'On the edge: drugs and consumption of risk in late modernity', in S. Lyng (ed.) *Edgework: The Sociology of Risk-taking*, pp. 227-245. London:

- Routledge.
- Rofel, L. (2007) *Desiring China: Experiments in Neoliberalism, Sexuality, and Public Culture*, Durham and London: Duke University Press.
- Rubin, G.S. (1993) 'Thinking sex: notes for a radical theory of the politics of sexuality', in C. Vance (ed.) *Pleasure and Danger: Exploring Female Sexuality*, Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- Sanders, T. (2005) *Sex Work: A Risky Business*, Devon: Willan.
- Sanders, T. (2008a) 'Male sexual scripts: intimacy, sexuality and pleasure in the purchase of commercial sex' *Sociology* 42(3): 400-417.
- Sanders, T. (2008b) *Paying for Pleasure: Men Who Buy Sex*, Devon: Willan.
- So, A.Y. (2003) 'Cross-border families in Hong Kong: the role of social class and politics', *Critical Asian Studies* 35 (4): 515-534.
- Song, G. (2004) *The Fragile Scholar: Power and Masculinity in Chinese Culture*, Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press.
- Song, G. and Hird, D. (2013) *Men and Masculinities in Contemporary China*, Leiden: Brill Publishers
- Song, G. and Lee, T. K. (2010) 'Consumption, class formation and sexuality: reading men's lifestyle magazines in China', *The China Journal*, 64: 159-177.
- Van Gulik, R.H. (1961) *Sexual Life in Ancient China: A Preliminary Survey of Chinese Sex and Society from ca. 1500 B.C. till 1644 A.D.*, Leiden, Netherlands: E.J. Brill.
- Weitzer, R. (2009) 'Sociology of Sex Work'. *Annual Review of Sociology* 35: 213-34.
- West, J. (2000) 'Prostitution: collectives and the politics of regulation', *Gender, Work & Organization* 7(2):106-118.
- Xiao, S.W. (2011) 'The "second wife" phenomenon and the relational construction of class-coded masculinities in contemporary China', *Men and Masculinities* 14 (5): 607-627.
- Zhang, T.T. (2006) 'Cool masculinity: male clients' sex consumption and business alliance in urban China's sex industry' *Journal of Contemporary China* 46: 161-182.